



AUN-QA PROGRAMME ASSESSMENT REPORT

AUN-QA Assessment No.: 183rd AUN-QA Programme Level Assessment	Date of Assessment: October 19-23, 2020
Name of Programme Assessed: Bachelor of Management (SM) Programme	
Name of University: Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang	
Name of Faculty/School: Faculty of Economics	
Name of Management Representative/Designation: Dr H, Nur Aswani, M.Ag.- Dean of Faculty of Economics Drs. Agus Sucipto, MM., CRA. – Head of SAR Team	Email:
Name of Assessors: Mr. Prem Anand M Arjunan (Finance Accreditation Agency, Malaysia) Associate Professor Marlene M. De Leon (Ateneo de Manila University, Philippines)	

Report Summary

This report is based on the information provided in the self-assessment report (SAR), evidences, site tour and interviews with selected stakeholders including academic and support staff, students, alumni and employers. It should be read together with the preliminary findings presented at the closing ceremony where the key strengths and areas for improvement were highlighted.

The AUN-QA assessment at programme level covers 11 criteria and each criterion is assessed based on a 7-point scale. The summary of the assessment results is as follows:

Criteria	Score
1. Expected Learning Outcomes	4
2. Programme Specification	4
3. Programme Structure and Content	4
4. Teaching and Learning Approach	4
5. Student Assessment	4
6. Academic Staff Quality	4
7. Support Staff Quality	4
8. Student Quality and Support	4
9. Facilities and Infrastructure	5
10. Quality Enhancement	4
11. Output	4
Overall Verdict:	“Adequate as Expected”

Based on the assessment results, the **Bachelor of Management (SM) Programme** has fulfilled the AUN-QA requirements. Overall, the quality assurance implemented for the programme is **“Adequate as Expected”**.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
1. Expected Learning Outcomes	1.1 The expected learning outcomes have been clearly formulated and aligned with the vision and mission of the university [1,2]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Learning outcomes were formulated to align with the University Mission and Vision. 2. Stakeholders were consulted to define the graduate profile needed by the community and this was used to formulate the learning outcomes of the Management Programme 3. The Graduate Profile of the Management Programme is defined 4. Integration of science, expertise, and behavior under the values of Islamic teachings from <i>Ulul Albab</i> are used in formulating the ELOs. 5. Clear mapping of graduate profile with ELOs has been established. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The establishment of an international reputation is part of the UIN's Vision. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1.1. An ELO that contributes to the department's development steps of increasing foreign language competence of the academics may be included to align with the University goal of achieving International Recognition and Reputation. 1.2. Consider exploring other means of establishing an international reputation such as research collaboration with researchers from other universities outside of Indonesia and establishing an institutional student exchange programme aside from just publishing in international journals and conferences proceedings. 2. Though ELOs have been clearly formulated, the application of Outcome Based Education (OBE) principles to ensure achievement of programme learning outcomes needs to be reinforced at the course delivery level. 3. Consider revising the formulation of ELOs by using a single action verb that is measurable and observable. Faculty of Economics (FE) may refer to Blooms Taxonomy to facilitate this process and make it easier to sort the ELOs according to the level of order-thinking skills from lowest to highest.
1. Expected Learning Outcomes	1.2 The expected learning outcomes cover both subject specific and generic (i.e. transferable)	Subject-specific skills were covered by ELOs.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Entrepreneurship is identified as a generic outcome but is not really specified in the ELO table of the programme. 2. Communication skills may be considered as a generic/ transferable skill.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
	learning outcomes [3]		3. The study programme may consider revising the graduate profiles to reflect the 3 areas of concentration.
1. Expected Learning Outcomes	1.3 The expected learning outcomes clearly reflect the requirements of the stakeholders [4]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. ELOs are reviewed every 4 years to ensure alignment with the labor market. 2. 3 mechanisms are in place for measuring the achievement of ELOs are in place: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Course assessment, ○ Graduating student feedback ○ Graduate survey 	Non-alumni employers and professional organization may also be consulted in the formulation of the expected learning outcomes and graduate profile.
2. Programme Specification	2.1 The information in the programme specification is comprehensive and up-to-date [1, 2]	The information in the programme specification is adequate.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. It is not clear in the Programme Specification how expected learning outcomes formulated in Criterion 1 will be achieved by students. The programme specification mapped specific subjects to specific competencies. However, it does not show how these competencies map to the expected learning outcomes formulated. Application of OBE principles in the preparation of Programme Specification will facilitate a clear presentation of how subjects/ courses will contribute to the achievement of learning outcomes. 2. Include ELOs in the Programme Specification to inform students and prospective students about it. 3. The programme specification and programme website do not provide a job profile (career prospect) for graduates. A job profile is an important means of attracting students to the programme, guiding students in the programme, and informing the curriculum review process. It is advised that the programme prepare a clear job profile for graduates

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
			and communicate the profile to the public via the programme website and programme specification.
2. Programme Specification	2.2 The information in the course specification is comprehensive and up-to-date [1, 2]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Course specifications are updated annually at the beginning of the academic year. 2. Content update is based on current development and stakeholder input. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Consider improving the presentation of constructive alignment of teaching and learning activities as well as assessment to the achievement of competency standards. 2. It is not clear in the course specification on how the students will be assessed and how they will be evaluated. Consider including assessment rubrics to provide students with standard criteria on how they will be evaluated through their assessments. 3. Course specification refers to competency standards that must be achieved by students or facilitated by a lecturer. The programme may consider formulating course learning outcomes according to OBE principles to provide students with a clearer understanding of what they should be able to do at the end of the course and verify themselves if they indeed are able to achieve the learning outcomes of the course.
2. Programme Specification	2.3 The programme and course specifications are communicated and made available to the stakeholders [1, 2]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Comprehensive programme specification is published in the Management Programme website. 2. Programme specification is presented during the 3-day Orientation for all new students. 3. Course specification is presented and discussed at the start of each course. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Programme Specification may be used as marketing collateral for prospective international students and research collaborators. Consider producing the programme specification to resemble a brochure to entice students (both local and international) to consider your programme for their bachelor's degree. 2. Programme specification could be made available in the website with the list of courses and the ELOs and job opportunity (at least).

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
			3. The FE could ensure that the website is accessible at all times.
3. Programme Structure and Content	3.1 The curriculum is designed based on constructive alignment with the expected learning outcomes [1]	Curriculum includes General courses that are integrated with major and subject specific courses to ensure alignment with the vision and mission of the University and the learning outcomes of study programme is achieved.	Programme specification may include mapping of courses to programme learning outcomes. This will allow the students to understand how the courses contribute to the achievement of course learning outcomes and why it is important for them to take the courses.
3. Programme Structure and Content	3.2 The contribution made by each course to achieve the expected learning outcomes is clear [2]	Courses are mapped to specific management competencies.	<p>1. It is hard to see the alignment of courses with expected learning outcomes of the programme. The courses are referring to competencies that must be achieved by the students but does not necessarily reflect how the competencies will contribute to the learning outcomes of the programme. Consider establishing a systematic plan for conducting an Outcomes Based Education training for the academic staff so they may understand the concept and how it should be implemented in the design and development of courses.</p> <p>2. It is recommended to establish a matrix that will show how each course learning outcome contribute towards the ELOs to identify areas of improvement and programme niche.</p>
3. Programme Structure and Content	3.3 The curriculum is logically structured, sequenced, integrated and up-to-date [3, 4, 5, 6]	<p>1. Course prerequisites are identified.</p> <p>2. Generic courses required to be taken by all UIN students are offered at the start of the programme to instil the Islamic teaching context under which skills and knowledge should be understood and applied in the latter years of the study programme.</p>	<p>1. The curriculum is a bit heavy on Accounting and Economics related courses. Consider integrating more relevant applied management courses and disruptive technologies into the curriculum such as Digital Marketing, Blockchain, AI, Decision Science, Supply Chain, Human Resource Information Systems, etc.</p> <p>2. Consider offering more major/specialized courses in English. A gradual increase of courses taught in</p>

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
			<p>English may be planned (at least one course to be offered in English per semester).</p> <p>3. It is suggested that the FE could integrate with other Faculties to offer Islamic Finance concentration. Based on the number of alumni working in the Islamic Banks and with the current facilities and expertise, this could be a major attraction for students.</p>
4. Teaching and Learning Approach	4.1 The educational philosophy is well articulated and communicated to all stakeholders [1]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Educational philosophy is published in different forms for consumption of different audiences. 2. It is explained by UIN leaders to internal and external stakeholders whenever possible. 	Formulating a more concise educational philosophy statement that members of the community may easily recall could be considered so that community members, especially the academic staff will be guided on why and how programmes and courses are designed and delivered.
4. Teaching and Learning Approach	4.2 Teaching and learning activities are constructively aligned to the achievement of the expected learning outcomes [2, 3, 4]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. An e-learning platform is institutionalized, and its use is supported by the University. 2. Academic staff of Management Programme have been using LMS even before the pandemic. It was not hard for them to shift to online delivery of teaching and learning activities. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Continuing professional development programmes may be made available to Academic staff to facilitate effective adoption of OBE principles. Programmes may include but are not limited to the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Introduction to OBE; o Creative teaching and learning techniques; o Assessment construction and administration. 2. As the expected learning outcomes use the verbs “demonstrate” and “apply”, the programme may consider more learning activities that involve application of skills, especially in a real-world or simulated context.
4. Teaching and Learning Approach	4.3 Teaching and learning activities enhance life-long learning [5]	Opportunities for participating in various activities that are envisioned to enhance life-long learning are available.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Though activities that may enhance life-long learning are available, it does not appear to be connected to particular courses that students should take in their study programme. Consider being more deliberate in integrating the life-long learning activities in all the courses to facilitate regular practice and systematic

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
			<p>reiteration of its value in their personal and professional development.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> It is recommended to explore equipping lifelong skills beyond the 4-year study as finance, human resource (HR), and marketing practitioners and alumni need to be constantly upgraded to meet their professional development needs particularly in the advancement in the financial services industry. It is recommended for the FE to extend company placement for all its students. This could be made available during the semester break.
5. Student Assessment	5.1 The student assessment is constructively aligned to the achievement of the expected learning outcomes [1, 2]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> There are various channels for selection and admission, and it is carried out according to the National requirement. A system is in place to ensure students are provided academic supervision throughout their studies in the University. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> The study programme may consider coming up with a comprehensive framework in measuring the achievement of learning outcomes. This way students will have an overall understanding on what they have to achieve in the programme of study and how they will be assessed while the study programme may use it to ensure effectiveness and appropriateness of assessment methods. The required score for TOEFL and TOAFL need to be communicated to the students clearly so that students will be aware of this as they prepare to take their exam.
5. Student Assessment	5.2 The student assessments including timelines, methods, regulations, weight distribution, rubrics and grading are explicit and	A standard scoring mechanism for thesis is available and effectively communicated to concerned stakeholders	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> The study programme could include more practical or problem-based types of assessments to promote active learning. Though the course specification and assessments disclose the scores allocated to assessments, there is no rubric to explain how scores are allocated to assess questions and components. It is advised that the programme develop rubrics for its assessments to

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
	communicated to students [4, 5]		improve accuracy, fairness, and transparency in grading.
5. Student Assessment	5.3 Methods including assessment rubrics and marking schemes are used to ensure validity, reliability and fairness of student assessment [6, 7]	A common marking scheme for Thesis is available.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Assessment rubrics could be incorporated in course specifications so students would have an idea how they will be evaluated. 2. Marking schemes may be shared and vetted to ensure reliability and fairness of student assessments. 3. To achieve assessment validity, the programme may involve more stakeholder input and review of assessments. In particular, the programme may solicit feedback from employers and alumni.
5. Student Assessment	5.4 Feedback of student assessment is timely and helps to improve learning [3]	Students may check their scores remotely and quickly through the Academic Information System.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Consider having a standard policy on how long faculty should provide feedback to students after taking exams, submitting projects, etc. 2. It is highly recommended that the results of continuous assessments are communicated to the students immediately so that the students could work on their weakness and improve their grades towards the end of the semester.
5. Student Assessment	5.5 Students have ready access to appeal procedure [8]	An appeal for change of grade procedure is in place and well communicated to concerned stakeholders.	Applications for appeal for change of grade may be incorporated in SIAKAD as a feature to facilitate easier submission and monitoring of appeals.
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.1 Academic staff planning (considering succession, promotion, re-deployment, termination, and retirement) is carried	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. There is a regulation for promotion of academic staff with a plan to promote 2 academic staff as Professors in 2020. 2. Academic staff planning is done upon carrying out a proper analysis on student number, workload etc. 	The FE could consider inviting industry practitioners to teach in some of the courses as their experiences and development of the rapid evolution in the industry and related markets could be shared with the students.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
	out to fulfil the needs for education, research and service [1]	3. A detailed handbook has been developed for academic staff ' <i>Pedoman Akademik Dosen</i> ' which clearly stated the requirement and the responsibilities of the academic staff.	
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.2 Staff-to-student ratio and workload are measured and monitored to improve the quality of education, research and service [2]	Staff to student ratio is well maintained and it is in accordance with the requirement of the National Accreditation Agency, BAN-PT.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Staff to student ratio could be still improved to be at par with other international management study programme to ensure learning effectiveness. 2. Consider reducing the number of students assigned to faculty for academic supervision to improve quality of advice and supervision accorded to each student. 3. The University/FE could arrange training on academic advising for all academic staff.
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.3 Recruitment and selection criteria including ethics and academic freedom for appointment, deployment and promotion are determined and communicated [4, 5, 6, 7]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. There is an institutionalized recruitment and selection process that is aligned with government and university regulations which includes assessment and interview sessions. 2. The prospective permanent academic staff would undergo a one-year trial with training on pedagogy, integration science, research methodology, statistics, personality, introduction of culture, philosophy, and norms applied to the University. 	The administrative appointment (for some positions) may be reviewed to be made as rotation to create more opportunities and motivation for staff to realise their potentials.
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.4 Competences of academic staff are identified and evaluated [3]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Semi-annual monitoring of faculty workload and publications are carried out. 2. FE has its own Quality Assurance Unit that monitors Student Satisfactory Index at the end of each semester. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Academic staff evaluation should be analyzed on semester basis and the results to be communicated to the academic staff in a timely manner in order for the academic staff to improve their performance in the following semester. 2. The faculty could process the results of the Student Satisfactory Index (near adequate level across all

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
			<p>Categories) so the faculty can plan for ways to improve it over time.</p> <p>3. In addition to the requirements of an academic degree, teaching abilities, and character, the programme may wish to explicitly identify technical competencies required to teach courses with the rapid advancement in the industries.</p>
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.5 Training and developmental needs of academic staff are identified, and activities are implemented to fulfil them [8]	Grants and opportunities for professional development are made available for academic staff.	<p>1. Training activities should be provided for the academic staff to successfully implement Outcomes-Based Education (OBE) as well as to prepare them for current and future development, i.e., IR 4.0 as well as on the current development in the respective industries, i.e., FinTech, Data Science/Data Analytics, Digital Marketing.</p> <p>2. The FE could also organise English proficiency courses for academic staff to preparation to offer more courses in English. (tie this up to content).</p> <p>3. It may be helpful to have individual development plans that explicitly addresses the need to develop subject expertise. Such a plan can guide academic staff as well as function as a tool for management to ensure staff are headed in the right direction and making efficient use of time and funding.</p> <p>4. The University could encourage academic staff to become members of professional bodies in which the academic staff could keep up to date with the industry requirement which could be embedded in the curriculum and teaching.</p>
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.6 Performance management including rewards	1. Performance of the academic staff is closely monitored via the Students Satisfactory Index by QA Unit of FE.	1. The University/ FE could also include the contribution of the academic staff in other duties such as

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
	and recognition is implemented to motivate and support education, research and service [9]	2. A remuneration system is in place, E-Smart to monitor the workload based on teaching, research and community services carried out.	involvement in curriculum design, development, and improvements 2. The University/ FE could establish a proper action plan/ advisory system to enhance the performance of the academic staff.
6. Academic Staff Quality	6.7 The types and quantity of research activities by academic staff are established, monitored and benchmarked for improvement [10]	1. Faculty are required to conduct research (at least 1 research per annum) and publish. 2. Annual research grants are made available by the Institute of Research and Community Service.	1. Consider benchmarking research output with other universities locally and internationally to see if the current research output of the Faculty of Economics is at par or may still be improved. 2. Collaborative research within and outside the University may be enhanced and promoted to facilitate integrated disciplinary approaches to real-life issues since the 3 concentration of this study programme is related to all industries.
7. Support Staff Quality	7.1 Support staff planning (at the library, laboratory, IT facility and student services) is carried out to fulfil the needs for education, research and service [1]	1. A need analysis is carried out and the request is made to the University for recruitment. 2. The FE has 15 support staff and the overall ratio of support staff to students are at an average of 1:21. 3. The support staff planning is aligned with the strategic plan of the faculty.	The FE could establish a clear manpower planning for the support staff which is very important with the technology age to support the needs for education, research, and services.
7. Support Staff Quality	7.2 Recruitment and selection criteria for appointment, deployment and promotion are determined and communicated [2]	There is an institutionalized recruitment and selection system for support staff that is aligned with government and university regulations.	The criteria for promotion could be communicated to the support staff in order for the support staff to enhance their competencies and to keep them motivated.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
7. Support Staff Quality	7.3 Competences of support staff are identified and evaluated [3]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. An established rotation system is made available to motivate and to ensure the job function of staff are according to the competencies. 2. Support staff satisfaction survey is conducted by SPI team. 	It is recommended that proper planning to be developed to identify the competencies of the support staff by taking into consideration the many activities and services that are offered online.
7. Support Staff Quality	7.4 Training and developmental needs of support staff are identified, and activities are implemented to fulfil them [4]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Training for support staff are identified at University and FE level and staff are encouraged to request for relevant training that is required to perform/enhance their job function. 2. The FE also encourages and provides opportunities for the support staff to pursue higher education. 3. Funds were allocated for training and competency development activities. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The FE could also encourage the support staff to attend more technical related trainings. 2. Consider developing individual career development plan for each support staff member to ensure that training opportunities are provided according to their expertise and interest. 3. Career-pathing of support staff, particularly those with higher qualifications may be implemented to optimize their competencies.
7. Support Staff Quality	7.5 Performance management including rewards and recognition is implemented to motivate and support education, research and service [5]	An institutional online system called E-SMART manages employee performance to determine remuneration and benefits accorded to each employee depending on their performance for a given period.	See 7.3.
8. Student Quality and Support	8.1 The student intake policy and admission criteria are defined, communicated, published, and up-to-date [1]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The UIN Malang website defines and communicates the student intake policy and admission criteria. The site provides comprehensive information that applicants may need to for admission to the university and respective study programmes. 	The student intake policy could be reviewed and benchmarked in order to attract more international students.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
		2. The University also reach out to the students via the school visit to promote the University and the programme.	
8.Student Quality and Support	8.2 The methods and criteria for the selection of students are determined and evaluated [2]	The University considers the different forms and levels of achievement of its prospective students. They provide different tracks for admission. The criteria for selection are determined.	A study on the validity of the student selection criteria and admission may be carried out to ensure that this is not an issue of students not graduating on time.
8.Student Quality and Support	8.3 There is an adequate monitoring system for student progress, academic performance, and workload [3]	SIAKAD is accessible to academic staff, lecturers, and students to facilitate monitoring of student progress, academic performance, and workload.	Monitoring and support for students who take longer time than expected to graduate may be continuously reviewed to ensure that their needs are determined and fulfilled.
8.Student Quality and Support	8.4 Academic advice, co-curricular activities, student competition, and other student support services are available to improve learning and employability [4]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Students have access to academic supervisors (DPA). Monitoring is conducted at least 4 times every semester in the form of course programming, KRS, and exam consultations I and II. 2. Intra-campus student organizations (OMIK) provide opportunities for extra-curricular activities to allow students to pursue non-academic interests and develop other skills and talents. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Consider providing student exchange opportunities and study trips. These opportunities will allow them to learn and experience challenges, solutions, techniques, and technology that may not be available in the study programme. 2. The FE could establish partnership with alumni and industry to improve the internship and employability opportunity for students.
8.Student Quality and Support	8.5 The physical, social and psychological environment is conducive for education and research as well as	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. At the faculty level, laboratories that support development of specific competences are available to students to expose them to industry standard tools and practices. 2. Counselling sessions for non-academic matters are made available with the Psychology Department. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Various courses may provide opportunities for ideation and creation of new businesses or new methods in doing business with partnership with the entrepreneurship laboratory. 2. Psychological counselling session made available should be communicated to all students.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
	personal well-being [5]		
9. Facilities and Infrastructure	9.1 The teaching and learning facilities and equipment (lecture halls, classrooms, project rooms, etc.) are adequate and updated to support education and research [1]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Common and specialized teaching and learning facilities are available and dedicated for the use of the Management study programme to support its teaching and learning activities and it is planned to support the University Strategic Plan with the concept of green, smart and Islamic values. 2. An e-Complaint system is available for various members of the University to submit criticisms and suggestions related to facilities and infrastructure. 3. Internal quality audits of facilities are carried out. 	Flexible learning facility design that supports student-centered learning (SCL), such as the design and configuration of classrooms and computer labs could be explored.
9. Facilities and Infrastructure	9.2 The library and its resources are adequate and updated to support education and research [3, 4]	The library and its resources are adequate to support the education and research for physical and online teaching and learning.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Consider expanding subscription to online international journals and proceedings so that faculty and students may have access to more relevant research. 2. The University/FE could conduct a survey on the opening hours of the libraries if it is necessary to extend the time during examination week.
9. Facilities and Infrastructure	9.3 The laboratories and equipment are adequate and updated to support education and research [1, 2]	Designated labs (i.e., Capital Market Lab, Mini Bank Lab, and Entrepreneurial Lab) are made available for students to make references to the latest data and carry out discussion on businesses/projects funded by industry and trading simulations.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The designated labs could be equipped with more computers to support and encourage more students to work from the labs. 2. The FE could work with the industry to set up a digital marketing lab where students can carry out and get insights of digitalization in the marketing industry.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
9. Facilities and Infrastructure	9.4 The IT facilities including e-learning infrastructure are adequate and updated to support education and research [1, 5, 6]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Various IT facilities (i.e., Moodle e-learning portal, Google Classroom, SIAKAD platforms) are available. 2. Software and applications are built in house by the University's IT department to meet the requirement and support the teaching and learning activities. 3. The University has taken steps to establish partnership with telco companies to provide free internet data for students to switch to online classes. 	Production or curation of digital content for alternative method of teaching (e.g., flipped classroom) may be considered to enhance the teaching and learning process and maximize the use and benefits of the e-Learning system.
9. Facilities and Infrastructure	9.5 The standards for environment, health and safety; and access for people with special needs are defined and implemented [7]	The quality and management of learning facilities and infrastructure are maintained in accordance with the ISO 9001:2015 standards, which include elements of building safety, health, comfort, and safety.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. It is recommended that a review on access for people with special needs be conducted. 2. To place fire escape plan and fire extinguishers at the appropriate areas i.e. classroom, labs, and corridors.
10. Quality Enhancement	10.1 Stakeholders' needs and feedback serve as input to curriculum design and development [1]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Feedback from alumni are gathered through surveys as input to the review and development of the Management SP curriculum as well as expectations and perspectives on the type and level of competency. 2. The University Supervisory Board has been established to ensure that the curriculum is constantly updated with the requirement or feedback of the stakeholders. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. It is suggested that the FE could establish a systematic approach to collect and process stakeholders' feedback i.e. annual survey, focus group session, industry dialogue etc. 2. It is suggested that the FE to carry out proper benchmarking exercise with other universities offering similar programme to ensure the content is up the requirement of global standards and future best practices. 3. It is suggested that FE could obtain feedback from relevant professional bodies and the industry in related areas for finance, marketing, and human resources.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
			4. The FE could consider having tie-ups with professional bodies to incorporate some of the professional programme elements into the programme.
10. Quality Enhancement	10.2 The curriculum design and development process is established and subjected to evaluation and enhancement [2]	The curriculum design and development process are established with review and approval from various units at University and Faculty level in accordance to the National Higher Education regulations.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. It may also benefit the study programme to conduct exit surveys to all graduating students regarding the curriculum, faculty, facilities, and student support services. This way more students will get to provide their feedback and a more comprehensive insight about the study programme may be discovered. 2. The University/FE could establish a proper monitoring system to ensure the feedback from the stakeholders are processed and evaluated to be incorporated in the curriculum.
10. Quality Enhancement	10.3 The teaching and learning processes and student assessment are continuously reviewed and evaluated to ensure their relevance and alignment [3]	Student assessment are reviewed, and changes are made in the beginning of each semester.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. It is recommended that the teaching and learning process are reviewed frequently to ensure that the methodology used are current and aligned to SCL approach. 2. In making learning fun, the FE could introduce gamification as one of the teaching and learning methodology as well as other methods which is suitable for SCL. 3. Implementation of OBE could enhance the constructive alignment of the teaching and learning methods and assessment with the learning outcomes. 4. A well-planned benchmarking exercise with other programmes (i.e., content and teaching-learning methodology) as a way to enhance the quality is suggested.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
10. Quality Enhancement	10.4 Research output is used to enhance teaching and learning [4]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Involvement of academic staff in research project with ministries, industries, and local government are useful to enhance the teaching and learning (i.e., embedded in some of the courses like entrepreneurship, Islamic resource management, strategic management, financial management, and marketing management.) 2. Academic staff are given the autonomy to enrich the teaching materials and the teaching methods from the research carried out. 	The FE could consider getting the students involved the research project with industries to enhance the lifelong learning experience for the students as well as valuable experience for students in carrying out their own research and thesis writing.
10. Quality Enhancement	10.5 Quality of support services and facilities (at the library, laboratory, IT facility and student services) is subjected to evaluation and enhancement [5]	Quality of support services and facilities are monitored and evaluated on a semester basis from the feedback obtained from the learning experience and teaching evaluation survey.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Results of these surveys and discussions should be systematically processed, monitored, acted upon and communicated to all departments or improvement. 2. A well-planned study to identify necessary facilities to meet the SCL approach is needed.
10. Quality Enhancement	10.6 The stakeholder's feedback mechanisms are systematic and subjected to evaluation and enhancement [6]	The programme uses survey instruments to collect feedback mainly from internal stakeholders.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The FE could have more systematic survey instruments and these surveys shall target the external stakeholders as well. These survey instruments need to be subject to a review and revision process. 2. Results of these surveys and discussions may be systematically processed and monitored for improvement. 3. It is good to open the survey channels for general feedback rather than just for complaint since positive feedback could also be an indicator to enhance the learning programme or to capture the preference of the stakeholders.

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
11. Output	11.1 The pass rates and dropout rates are established, monitored and benchmarked for improvement [1]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Pass rates and dropout rates are established and monitored. There is an increase in the performance of student from 2014 – 2018 based on the average GPA. 2. Benchmarking with another study programme within the FE was conducted. 	Benchmarking may be expanded to other national and international universities. It may help validate if indeed the UIN-Malang Management study programme is doing well in terms of student output and may provide ideas in setting improvement goals for pass and dropout rates.
11. Output	11.2 The average time to graduate is established, monitored and benchmarked for improvement [1]	Average time to graduate was established, monitored, and benchmarked for improvement.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Consider establishing standards on how academic advisers monitor study improvement of student assigned to them. 2. Define standard key performance indicators (KPI) that may be measured by monitoring systems to measure effectivity of each intervention implemented to decrease the average time to graduate and to determine which intervention/s are truly effective.
11. Output	11.3 Employability of graduates is established, monitored and benchmarked for improvement [1]	Benchmarking is conducted with another programme in the Faculty of Economics to gain insights on how the Management study programme may be improved.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Continuous professional training may be provided to the graduates to enhance their employability and life-long learning skills which is very important with the development in the financial services industry in which many graduates are employed. 2. Consider benchmarking with other universities offering similar programmes to see how the Management study programme and its graduates fare compared to the other study programmes and its respective graduates. 3. It is recommended that the Faculty establish a strategic partnership with the stakeholders. This could benefit the programme as well as the graduates. For example, a close working relationship with the alumni, through the establishment of an Alumni Association at the Faculty level, could help the Faculty to place

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
			<p>students for the internship programme and the alumni could also employ the students upon graduation.</p> <p>4. Similarly, a strategic partnership with employers would assist in hiring graduates as well as contribution/funding towards teaching and learning facilities, i.e., simulation and practice labs.</p> <p>5. Consider establishing more partnership with organization that could offer opportunities for graduate from Marketing and Human Resource concentrations.</p>
11. Output	11.4 The types and quantity of research activities by students are established, monitored and benchmarked for improvement [2]	<p>The types and quantity of research are by students are monitored.</p> <p>Students are encouraged to carry out research and for publication and Research Competition are organized to motivate students to do research.</p>	<p>1. Consider establishing targets for research activities and publications to increase exposure of students to research work and work of other researchers.</p> <p>2. A student conference within the study programme may be organized to provide students with a platform to present their research/thesis output, get feedback for improvement, and recruit students from the lower batch to continue to work and improve on the research output presented.</p>
11. Output	11.5 The satisfaction levels of stakeholders are established, monitored and benchmarked for improvement [3]	Tracer study included items to measure the alumni's agreement to having achieved competence set by the national government.	<p>1. Consider measuring the satisfaction level of students and alumni on the articulated expected learning outcomes and their own satisfaction level in achieving the expected learning outcomes to gauge if the students and alumni agree with the expected learning outcomes and if the study program is successful in helping the students and alumni achieve the learning outcomes.</p> <p>2. There is the necessity to determine stakeholders' satisfaction level regularly and systematically, and establish mechanisms for follow-up action and</p>

Criteria		Strengths	Areas for Improvement
			<p>benchmarking reports, in order to achieve continuous programme, policy, and process improvement.</p> <p>3. It is suggested by the employers that more courses in digitalization could be offered that is relevant to the 3 concentrations, i.e., big data, online marketing.</p> <p>4. It is suggested by the students and alumni that more courses could be taught in English, which would allow the students to practice the language more, and it will benefit the students at their workplace.</p>